# **Appendix A: Templates for paper categorization**

In grey background, we have the answers considered as correct.

**Template for Paper A**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Characterize the conceptual modeling context of this work | List the representation used/treated as a conceptual model in this work | 1-Ontological pattern |
| 2- Any model |
| 3- no models |
| Which groups of users are likely to create, modify, read, or otherwise use this representation? | 1-Subgroup of subjects except “Software, database, or knowledge representation implementors” AND “Software, database, or knowledge representation system performance specialists” |
| 2-Subgroup of subjects including “Software, database, or knowledge representation implementors” OR “Software, database, or knowledge representation system performance specialists” |
| 3- All |
| 4- Others |
| What is captured in this representation? | 1- Data AND Knowledge, rules, “smart” systems |
| 2- Data |
| 3- Knowledge, rules, “smart” systems |
| 4- No data OR Knowledge, rules, “smart” systems |
| 5- Data OR Knowledge, rules, “smart” systems WITH any other |
| 6- Others |
| What is the level of abstraction for this representation? | 1- Computation-Independent |
| 2- Platform-independent |
| 3- Platform specific |
| 4-Other or several options |
| A model, language, metamodel, notation… for conceptual modeling | List the model, conceptual modeling language, notation, or metamodel | 1-Ontoloy |
| 2- No model |
| 3- Any model apart from ontology |
| What is the nature of the significant contribution? | 1- Define or extend a model, language, notation, representation, metamodel, OR Provide a formal definition |
| 2- Define or extend a model, language, notation, representation, metamodel |
| 3- Provide a formal definition |
|  | 4- NO Define or extend a model, language, notation, representation, metamodel, OR Provide a formal definition |
| 5- Define or extend a model, language, notation, representation, metamodel, OR Provide a formal definition WITH any other |
| 6- Other |
| Contribution | 1- An ontology for rocks |
| 2- Other |

**Template for Paper B**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Characterize the conceptual modeling context of this work | List the representation used/treated as a conceptual model in this work | 1- MAP OR Class diagram OR BPMN |
| 2- DEMOS |
| 3- Any model |
| 4- no models |
| Which groups of users are likely to create, modify, read, or otherwise use this representation? | 1- Subgroup of subjects except “Software, database, or knowledge representation implementors” AND “Software, database, or knowledge representation system performance specialists” |
| 2-Subgroup of subjects including “Software, database, or knowledge representation implementors” OR “Software, database, or knowledge representation system performance specialists” |
| 3- All |
| 4- Others |
| What is captured in this representation? | 1- Data AND (Processes (e.g. business processes, goals, preferences, priorities, ...) OR Scenarios, events, agents, Interactions (e.g. among human users and automated components, ...) |
| 2- Data |
| 3- Processes OR Scenarios, events, agents, Interactions (e.g. among human users and automated components, ...) |
| 4- NO Data OR Processes (e.g. business processes, goals, preferences, priorities, ...) OR Scenarios, events, agents, Interactions (e.g. among human users and automated components, ...) |
| 5- Data OR Processes (e.g. business processes, goals, preferences, priorities, ...) WITH OTHERS |
| 6- Others |
| What is the level of abstraction for this representation? | 1- Computation-Independent AND Platform-Independent |
| 2- Computation-Independent |
| 3- Platform-Independent |
| 4- Platform-Specific |
| 5-Other |
| Method/process, tool, algorithm | List the method, process, tool, or algorithm | 1- Identify end-users, define view points, Design a Model by Viewpoint, Consolidate Viewpoint Models |
| 2- Other |
| What is its purpose? | 1- “CM validation, simulation, verification” |
| 2-“CM integration, exchange, migration” |
| 3-“CM instance generation” |
| 4-“CM validation, simulation, verification” OR “CM integration, exchange, migration” OR “CM instance generation” |
| 5- Any except “CM validation, simulation, verification” OR “CM integration, exchange, migration” |
| 6-“CM validation, simulation, verification” OR “CM integration, exchange, migration” with OTHER |
| 7- Other |
| What is the nature of the significant contribution? | 1- “Define or extend a method/process, tool, algorithm” |
| 2- “Evaluate the method/process, tool, algorithm, e.g. through a case study, performance study, or user study” |
| 3-“Define or extend a method/process, tool, algorithm” AND “Evaluate the method/process, tool, algorithm, e.g. through a case study, performance study, or user study” |
| 4- Any except “Define or extend a method/process, tool, algorithm” OR “Evaluate the method/process, tool, algorithm, e.g. through a case study, performance study, or user study” |
| 5-“Define or extend a method/process, tool, algorithm” OR “Evaluate the method/process, tool, algorithm, e.g. through a case study, performance study, or user study” with ANY OTHER |
| 6- Other |
| Describe the contribution | 1- Description of the DEMOS method, a method to generate democratic information systems. The paper describes the 4 steps of the method and describes a short illustrative example (named experiment in the paper) |
| 2- Other |

**Template for Paper C**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Characterize the conceptual modeling context of this work | List the representation used/treated as a conceptual model in this work | 1-Data collection and Database |
| 2- Data collection or database |
| 3- Any model |
| 4- no models |
| Which groups of users are likely to create, modify, read, or otherwise use this representation? | 1-All |
| 2-Subgroup of subjects |
| 3- Others |
| What is captured in this representation? | 1-At least Data |
| 2- At least (Data + Processes) |
| 3- No data |
| 4- Others |
| What is the level of abstraction for this representation? | 1-Three or two of them |
| 2- Computation-Independent |
| 3- Platform-Independent |
| 4- Platform-Specific |
| 5-Other |
| CM vision, philosophy, principles, or review of the CM field | What type of high-level contribution is made? | 1-A broad survey of the field of conceptual modeling OR A vision of the field of conceptual modeling |
| 2- A broad survey of the field of conceptual modeling or A vision of the field of conceptual modeling TOGETHER with any other |
| 3- No A broad survey of the field of conceptual modeling OR A vision of the field of conceptual modeling |
| 4- Other |
| Contribution | 1- Bibliometric analysis of major outlets for conceptual modeling research |
| 2- Other |